November 2020

Financial Stability Review

Paul Hiebert

Head of Systemic Risk and Financial Institutions Division

JVI Webinar: Key Global and European Risks to Financial Stability
Wednesday, December 2, 2020
Financial stability vulnerabilities have increased

Growing vulnerability of asset prices to correction
- Elevated negative rating outlooks
- Large debt issuance increases leverage
- Growing equity sector dispersion
- Stretched valuations in some asset classes

Further weakening of bank profitability amid higher credit losses
- Low market valuations
- Increasing credit risk
- Rising sovereign exposure
- Improved funding conditions

The outlook is dominated by the pandemic, although extensive policy support has helped lessen the impact significantly.

There is a need to carefully manage the exit from the comprehensive fiscal policy package to avoid cliff edges…

... including ensuring bank capital buffers remain usable to limit deleveraging, while developing an effective macroprudential framework for non-banks.

Rising debt servicing challenges for firms, households and sovereigns
- Possible sovereign risk reassessment
- Risk of sovereign-corporate nexus
- Worsening labour market conditions
- Risk of property market correction

Increasing credit and liquidity risk of non-banks amid renewed risk-taking
- Renewed fund inflows
- Increased exposure to corporate credit risk
- Decline in cash and liquid asset holdings
- Profitability challenges for insurers

High-yield firms rated B- or lower
- 2008: 8.8%
- 2020: 28.3%

Default probability of new corporate loans
- Q1 20: 1.5%
- Q2 20: 2.1%

Analysts' 2021 bank ROE forecasts
- 01/20: 6.5%
- 11/20: 3.1%

Debt securities transactions of funds
- Q1 20
- Q2 20

Analysts' 2021 bank ROE forecasts
Economic fragmentation risk

- Some signs of recovery, but it all depends on path of infections and government action.
- Economic recovery from pandemic lows has been highly dispersed across sectors and countries.

**Real GDP growth rates and government stringency index**

Index, annual percentage changes

Sources: Eurostat, Oxford University, JHU

**Dispersion of value-added growth across euro area countries and sectors**

Q1 2000 – Q2 2020, percentage points

Sources: Eurostat and ECB calculations.
Corporate vulnerabilities: Underlying versus manifest

- Financial health of firms has deteriorated strongly, but is supported by policy measures
- Absent policy support or with a disappointing recovery, corporate bankruptcies could rise

Composite indicator of corporate vulnerabilities and underlying driving factors
Q1 2000-Q2 2020, z-scores

Composite indicator, number of corporate insolvencies in the euro area and real GDP growth over time
Q2 2000-Q2 2020, z-scores, percentages

Sources: Eurostat, IHS Markit, ECB and ECB calculations
Crucial government support amid uneven pandemic impacts

- SMEs have relied more on government guaranteed loans than larger companies
- Corporate earnings particularly weak in countries with high levels of sovereign debt

**Reliance on government-guaranteed loans by firm size**
DE, IT, FR, ES; Q2 2020; € billion (left scale), % (right scale)

**Non-financial firm profits by sovereign indebtedness**
2014-20, € billions

Sources: Anacredit, FINREP and national sources.

Sources: European Commission and ECB calculations.
Household sector also cushioned by government support schemes

- Social transfers and temporary relief in tax burdens helped to maintain household’s disposable income…
- … but consumer confidence remains below its long run average

Household gross disposable income and contributing components
Q2 2009, Q2 2020, annual percentage changes

Consumer confidence and households’ expectations for unemployment and their financial situation over the next year
Percentage balances

Sources: Eurostat, ECB and ECB staff calculations.

Sources: ECB, European Commission and ECB calculations.
Medium term risk from potential sovereign-corporate-bank nexus

- Debt sustainability concerns are on the rise, even if mitigated in the near-term by low interest rates, favourable financing conditions and large-scale supranational support

Indebtedness of the general government and non-financial private sector across the euro area
Q4 2019 vs. Q2 2020, percentages of GDP

Sources: ECB and ECB calculations.

Banks’ domestic government bond holdings and corporate NPL ratios across the euro area
percentage of total assets, percentages of total corporate loans

Size of the bubble: 10-year sovereign bond yield

Sources: ECB (BSI statistics and supervisory statistics), Bloomberg and Reuters.
Risks in reducing policy support too early ... or too late

- Euro area non-financial firms and households are cushioned by various government support measures.
- But risks arise either from a premature end to measures or from prolonged support.

**Timeline of the phasing-out of different policies**

**Dates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy Type</th>
<th>DE</th>
<th>FR</th>
<th>IT</th>
<th>ES</th>
<th>NL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tax deferrals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct grants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-time working schemes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan moratoria schemes - average expiration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guarantee schemes - duration of loans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guarantee schemes - application window</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: National authorities and EBA notifications.
Notes: Cut-off date: 10 November 2020. Guaranteed loans mature at the latest in: mid-2031 in DE, mid-2027 in FR and NL, end-2030 in IT, mid-2029 in ES.

**Euro area banks’ corporate loan books affected by guarantees and moratoria**

€ billions, percentages

Sources: EBA, national authorities and ECB calculations.
Striking recovery in financial markets

- Equity market response strong, albeit with some segmentation
- Corporate spreads have declined to near pre-Covid levels

Development of the EURO STOXX and S&P 500 stock indices and selected sectoral constituents indices, 1 January 2020 = 100

Corporate bond spread per rating category basis points and ratings

Sources: Bloomberg Finance L.P and ECB calculations.

Source: IHS Markit, Merrill Lynch and ECB calculations.
Quiescent bond markets and deteriorating corporate credit quality

- Sovereign bond market fragmentation pressures have eased
- Corporate credit quality has deteriorated and negative rating outlooks stand at historically high levels

Sovereign bond yields over overnight index swap rate and dispersion of sovereign yields

Credit rating downgrades, negative credit rating outlook and share of high yield issuers
Number and percentage

Sources: Refinitiv, Bloomberg
Notes: The dashed vertical lines denote the announcement of the PEPP on 18 March 2020, the expansion of the PEPP on 4 June 2020 and the announcement of the EU recovery fund on 21 July 2020.
A tale of two property markets

- Contrasting commercial and residential property market developments
- Liquidity has been low and valuation metrics suggest that price corrections are likely

**Real GDP growth, nominal RRE price growth and RRE valuation estimates**
annual percentage changes, percentages

- Source: ECB and ECB calculations.

**CRE transactions in the euro area**
Number of transactions

- Sources: RCA and ECB calculation.

**Sectoral REIT price indices**
index, 17 February 2020 =100

- Source: Bloomberg Finance L.P.
Banks resilient so far, but profitability remains low

- Bank profitability declined substantially in the first half of 2020 and recovery is expected to be slow.
- Lower interest income for banks from ongoing margin compression.

**Euro area banks’ ROE and drivers of change in ROE**
Q4 2019, Q2 2020, percentages, percentage points

**Government stringency index, real GDP growth and 2021 ROE forecasts**
31 Dec. 2019-09 Nov. 2020, percentages

**Drivers of change in euro area banks’ net interest income**
Q4 2018 – Q2 2020, percentage changes and percentage point contributions

Sources: ECB (supervisory data) and ECB calculations.
Note: figures are on a trailing four-quarter basis.
The future path for lending will depend on expiry or extension of state guarantees

- Lending to NFCs in 2020 was strongly driven by loan guarantees
- Going forward credit standards are expected to tighten amid higher credit risk

Lending growth to households and NFCs as well as NFC lending flows vs. loan guarantees

Changes in credit standards for loans to NFCs and households for house purchases
Q4 2019, Q3 2020, net percentages of banks reporting a tightening of credit standards and contributing factors

Source: ECB MFI balance sheet statistics, Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (DE), Fédération Bancaire Française (FR), Ministero dello Sviluppo Economico e Mediocredito Centrale and Associazione Bancaria Italiana (IT), Ministerio de Asuntos Economicos y Transformación Digital (ES)

Note: State guaranteed loans granted until end-October.
Credit risk has increased since the start of the pandemic.

- Increase in provision inflows into stage 2 assets. But euro area banks provisioned less than US banks and less than implied by history, this may partly reflect policy support.

In- and outflows of impairments to Stage 2 and Stage 3 class
2019 Q1 – 2020 Q2, % of total assets in respective asset stage

Sources: ECB supervisory data and ECB calculations.

Loan loss provisioning of euro area and US listed banks
Q1 2010-Q2 2020, percentage of total loans

Sources: Bloomberg Finance L.P. and ECB calculations.

Notes: Based on a sample of 20 listed euro area banks and 17 listed US banks.

Actual and model-implied provisions of euro area banks
Q1 2004 – Q2 2020, percentages of total loans

Sources: ECB supervisory data and ECB calculations.
Low bank valuations

- Price-to-book ratios remain lower than global peers
- A relatively high degree of dispersion across euro area banks (albeit with downside skew)

Banks’ price-to-book ratios
20 Feb.-17 Nov. 2020, percentage changes

Sources: Sources: Bloomberg Finance L.P. and ECB calculations.
Notes: based on a sample of 59 listed banks. Right panel based on a sample of 59 banks
Non-bank financial intermediaries continue to increase risk-taking

- The sector continued to provide significant financing for companies – also in pandemic-sensitive sectors
- The market turmoil in March led to pro-cyclical asset sales by non-banks

Euro area financial sector’s net purchases of newly issued medium- to longer-term debt Q4 2019 - Q2 2020, € billions

Sources: ECB securities holdings statistics and ECB calculations.
Notes: Net transactions in debt securities with original maturities of over one year. Sensitive sectors are expected to be affected especially hard by the coronavirus-related restrictions; these include mining, manufacturing, retail and wholesale trade, transport, hotels and restaurants, and arts and entertainment.

Euro area financial sectors’ net transactions in debt securities by credit rating of the issuer Q1 - Q2 2020, € billions

Sources: ECB securities holdings statistics and ECB calculations.
Continued (il)liquidity concerns in investment funds

- Investment funds received significant inflows since start of PEPP purchases
- After temporary increase following the March turmoil, funds’ cash holdings reverted back to pre-crisis levels

### Cumulative investment fund flows

**percentage of AuM**

Sources: EPFR Global and ECB calculations. Note: Data refer to euro area-domiciled funds only.

### Interquartile range of liquid asset holdings of corporate bond and MMF funds

**percentage of AuM, left-hand scale: IG and HY; right-hand scale: MMFs**

Sources: Refinitiv (Lipper) and ECB calculations.
Lower rates for longer may induce further risk-taking by insurers

- Insurers’ solvency ratios remained relative strong despite recent deterioration
- Pressures on profitability from low interest rates and higher claims could induce further risk-taking by insurers.

**Solvency Capital Requirement ratios**

percentages, 10th-90th percentile boxplots

Sources: SNL and ECB calculations.

---

**Projected debt portfolio shares by rating to avoid or dampen expected reduction of investment income**

left-hand scale: percentage of debt portfolio, right-hand scale: percentage

Sources: ECB Securities Holdings Statistics by Sector, ECB insurance corporation balance sheet statistics and ECB calculations.
Policy Roadmap

**Economic policies**

- Contain immediate economic fallout
  - Limit procyclicality while enhancing resilience
    - Bank capital buffer release
    - Dividend restrictions
    - “CRR quick fix”
- Ensure near-term recovery
  - Respond to perceived policy uncertainties
    - Gradually restore capital
    - Options for managing NPLs
    - Develop contingency plans
- Prepare for the future
  - Strengthen institutional and policy set-up
    - Banking union and CMU
    - Macroprudential space
    - Non-bank regulation
  - Manage medium-term financial stability risks
    - Debt sustainability
    - Sovereign-firm-bank nexus
    - Side effects of low rates

**Sources:** ECB.
Financial stability vulnerabilities have increased

Growing vulnerability to asset price correction
- Elevated negative rating outlooks
- Increasing corporate leverage
- Rising asset price inflation
- Growing equity sector dispersion

Further weakening of bank profitability amid higher credit losses
- Low market valuations
- Increasing latent credit risk
- Rising sovereign exposure
- Improved funding conditions

The outlook is dominated by the pandemic, although extensive policy support has helped lessen the impact significantly.

- High-yield firms rated B- or lower
- Default probability of new corporate loans
- Analysts’ 2020 bank ROE forecasts
- Debt securities transactions of funds
- Rising debt servicing challenges of firms, households and sovereigns
- Increasing credit and liquidity risk of non-banks amid renewed risk-taking

There is a need to carefully manage the exit from the comprehensive fiscal policy package to avoid cliff edges…

... and ensure bank capital buffers are usable to avoid excessive deleveraging, while developing an effective macroprudential framework for non-banks.